Research
The Teaching Trends and Methods in Public Schools, Private and Madrasahs: A comparative Study

Abdul Karim Keerio1, Dr Shabana Sartaj2, Syed Waqar Ali Shah3
1MS Scholar (ELDC), Mehran University of Engineering and Technology, Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan
2Assistant Professor, Department of English, Sindh Agriculture University, Tandojam, Sindh, Pakistan
3Lecturer, English Language Development Center (ELDC) Mehran University of Engineering and Technology (MUET), Jamshoro, Sindh, Pakistan

*Corresponding Author :
Abdul Karim Keerio
Email: abdulkarima66@gmail.com

Published online : 16 April, 2019

Abstract: In Pakistan three different types of Educational institutions functions including systems public, private and madrasahs. The hypothesis of this research is to identify key differences in private. Public and madrasah school in context of teaching methodology. The paper will explore the differences between these three school systems mentioned above. It will not include the critical analysis because the research requires only description of teaching methodology. This paper is based on interviews, focused group discussions, survey questionnaire and class room observation conducted with private, public and madrasah teachers/students in Hyderabad to gauge what, in their view, is the teaching methodology. We have selected the schools which were suitable for this research. We attempted to analyze the curriculum of these schools systems and its impact on the students. It also provides some recommendations for these three school systems.

Keywords: Teachers, Education, Private, Public, Madrasah

1. Introduction

Education plays vital role in the formation human capitals. Literacy rate of the country directly affects all the domains that are necessary for a state. Pakistan has the second highest number of out-of-school children in the world (UNESCO, 2015). Sustainable economic development needs skilled manpower which is raised through productivity and efficiency of individuals that is only possible through education (Nasir&Nazli, 2010). In Pakistan the educational institutes are comprised of approximately 260,903, and it is assisting 4,018,384 students in assistance of 1,535.46l teachers. Round about 25.97 million students are
registered in public sector to complete their education and in private sector 14.85 million students are being served, among the middle schools (class six to eight). 39% are public schools whereas 61% is in private sector. According to data collected in 2011-2012, there are 13,075 “Deeni Madaris” working in Pakistan. Approximately 1.759 million students are enrolled in Deeni Madaris. Therefore, schooling in Pakistan is highly stratified and designed along diverse pathways. This divisive system has been a cause of concern for many Pakistanis and according to a questionnaire, floated on the internet, a few days ago, out of the 30 respondents, 28 thought that the current educational system needs more standardization (Online Survey). This issue has been analyzed by various intellectuals and political commentators in the country. According to Rehman (2006), a distinguished intellectual highlighted this social ill in his book, “Denizens of Alien Worlds”. He explained how these systems of education are developing mindsets and ideologies which are mutually incompatible. We feel that this stratified schooling structure leads to creation and reinforcement of social and economic inequality as well as ideological fissures which disrupts social cohesion and nation-building. This is due to the divergent learning environments, teaching methodologies, curriculum and mindsets operational in each kind of schooling. From a comparative vantage point, my assumption is that private schools provide better quality education.

2. Literature Review

At global level the present literature on the comparisons in public sector school, private sector and madrasahs is considerably limited with reference to Pakistan in particular. Several prior studies provide evidence on the relative usefulness of public versus private schools in developing countries is that the foretold performance of students in private schools is higher than foretold performance in government schools (Jimenez et al., 1991; Kingdon, 1996). As stated by Sadruddin (2013) that the productivity of the school depends on its management system and the administration staffing working under a system. School administration plays vital role in the quality education.

2.1. Private schools

In private schools teachers face higher accountability and supervision which ensures that they perform their tasks. Teaching methodology used is also more heartening as modern approaches such as activity based learning, child-centered approach, participation of students and critical assessment methods are existent. As Liaqat (2009) in his study observed private schools have better teaching as compare to those of public schools and the teachers of private come up with complete teaching plans and strategies to be taught in the school. Private
tutoring outside of school is prevalent among students from both rural and urban areas (Dundar et al., 2014). However, private schools fail to overcome the problem of access to quality education for most Pakistanis as they are exclusive to those who can afford to pay high fees. Private schools also employ more untrained staff than government schools, where teachers are paid significantly more (Andrabi et al. 2010; French and Kingdon 2010). According to the findings of Garg (2000) that the private schools perform better as compare to public sector because of the closed system and strong management level. Moreover, private schools are also spread on a spectrum of quality and not all of them can be described as satisfactory. The probability of receiving extra tutoring is also related to income, gender and maternal education (Macpherson et al., 2014). Many low-cost private schools replete the country which often hire under qualified teachers and does not maintain a reasonable standard of education. Similarly, private schools are not immune to the circumstances faced by Pakistani society as a whole such as lower quality of human resource in teachers in general and societal attitudes towards education. Therefore, private schools also face similar constraints and can only be described as relatively better performers given the stark outcomes elsewhere. Suryadarma (2006) argues that performance of the school merely depends upon the quality and regularity of the teachers.

2.2. Public sector schools

Public sector schools provide education to a larger number of students than Private ones (more than 25 million as opposed to more than 14 million by private sector) and are mainly utilized by the lower economic classes of society. Despite of this benefit, the quality of public sector education is disappointing to say the least. However, salaries of teachers in government schools are usually tied to education and seniority rather than to student learning outcomes (Andrabi et al., 2010). A myriad of Problems known to us such as infrastructure and capacity constraints, lax administration and accountability, politicization of recruitment, teacher incompetence and low motivation of teachers and students exist in this sector. Teaching practices are unfortunately below par as the lecture method is exclusively relied upon by teachers; Students are mostly dictated content that they must memorize with little or no comprehension. Participation and discussion of students is insufficient and when it does occur, students simply regurgitate what they have wrote-learned already. A critical reflection, analysis and exchange of ideas in the discussions hardly exist. Teachers and students have low motivation to deliver with passion due to lack of supervision and interest of administrators and even parents as we noticed in our observation. Therefore, the government
middle schools which provide reasonable and modern educational outlook sadly fall among the anomalies.

2.3. Madrasahs
In Madrasahs students learn about the Holy Quran, Arabic and Islamic values (Rahman, 2004; Shah, 2006). Madrasahs cater to a small segment of the population which is predominantly poor. These institutions help provide shelter, food, recreation and a religious education for poor children and this is a positive social service for the impoverished. However, from an educational point of view, they lag far behind. The “Dars-e-Nizami”, which is the curriculum adhered to by most Pakistani madrasahs has a disproportionately large focus on “Islamic” aspects of education and secular subjects such as Science, Math, English and Social Studies are ignored or under-emphasized. Even in madrasahs where secular subjects are taught, they are interpreted with an ideological lens and this corrupts the positive impact such subjects can have on students. For example, hatred against the Western civilization may discourage students to passionately study English even if it is taught in Madrasahs. “In this regard, a madrasah teacher from Baluchistan mentioned that one of the biggest challenges he faces as an English teacher is to convince his students about the utility of the subject. Most of his students believe that by learning Islam, they will go to heaven. A similar motive or learning English is absent and they are not convinced that learning English is important” (madrasah education in the Pakistani context-academia.edu). The teaching methodology involves higher tendencies for corporal punishment and emphasis on discipline and order in the lifestyle of students. Teachers hardly tolerate dissent in matters of belief and thoughtful discourse and discussions are severely under-prioritized. Extreme sexual Segregation exists as girls and boys are taught in separate madrasahs. Harsh refutation of other sects and religions is common. The administration of madrasahs is better than government and even some private schools as very few madrasah teachers are thought to skip their classes. for example. Most students in this setting aspire to become “Muftis” and “Islamic scholars”, which we also discovered in our research. Therefore, the Madrasah system fails to develop people who can make a worthwhile contribution to the society or economy. The ideologically loaded education received by students, coupled with low employability of these students makes them liable to exploitation by militant and criminal elements. However, a lot of madrasahs also provide an admirable quality and environment, which promotes rigorous Islamic scholarship and education.

3. Objectives of the Study
1. To investigate and subsequently describe the teaching methods practiced in three schools (madrasah, public school and private school) in order to create knowledge regarding teaching practices in these different schooling systems.

2. To undertake a comparative analysis of the teaching methodology and highlight key differences and similarities in teaching techniques among the three schools.

3. To set a basis for further explanatory research on this topic, that illuminate the reasons for the existence of any differences in teaching methods that we may find in these three sectors.

4. **Research question**
   1. What are the different teaching methods in madrasahs, private and public school?
   2. What are the perceptions of people about these three (madrasahs, private schools and public schools)?

4.1. **Research Design**

The research was designed to highlight the key differences between the private, public and madrasah schools. It primarily focused on the teaching methodology of three different school systems which are mentioned above. In order to triangulate the information both quantitative and qualitative methods were used. Quantitative methods include random surveys of selected schools while qualitative methods include the in depth interviews and class room observations.

4.2. **Research Instruments**

The instruments used are listed below:

1. A survey questionnaire for in-school children designed to gauge their demographic profile, school conditions, behavior of teachers towards students and teaching methods.

2. Extensive review of literature written on teaching methodology in three school systems.

4.3. **Data collection Tools**

An inherent strength of using mixed methods is that it allows for the Use of a variety of data collection tools suitable to the research situation at hand. Therefore the following multiple data collection tools have been used. It includes semi-structured open-ended interviews with senior teachers and multiple students from each school; school/classroom observations; post-observation reflections after each class and quantitative surveys with students from each school under study. In addition, the study is based on sample schools as leading examples of their respective streams of education. The criteria on which we picked the teachers to be interviewed were at least five years of teaching experience. We randomly selected students from a list that was provided to us by each school’s administration. Moreover, study was
conducted on average three 30-minute in depth face-to-face semi-structured interviews with each participant. Each interview consisted of two parts. The first part was meant to probe each participant’s demographic information. The second part dealt more specifically with capital, class-habitus, the nature of participants’ involvement in the school, and other issues relating to education. This also included focusing on the Written and unwritten rules for the daily social transactions, nature of the relationship, Students level of obedience and resistance patterns, teacher’s time management appearance of faculty and students, quality and styles of their clothing, cleanliness, Mannerism, language and its level of refinement.

5. Comparative Analysis

5.1. Class Discussions

The primary units of analysis are teacher-student interaction in the class. We tried to find the extent to which teacher encouraged the students to participate in class. Class discussions offer students opportunities to test their ideas and opinions against the ideas and opinions of their peers. Class discussions are crucial part of learning, it helps student to encounter the ideas of his peers. Moreover, it is important to set the right tone for discussion in the classroom, and to establish a rapport with your students. Studies have shown that students who contribute to class conversations have more knowledge than their peers. Therefore, it is imperative to find Ways to involve all students in the formative discussions of the course. Teacher is supposed to maintain a healthy class discussion environment. Further, the class discussion has been frequently encouraged by the private Schools than other school systems. The data collected by in depth interviews and class room observation clearly shows that class discussions were intensely present in private school. However in government schools the behavior of teachers towards class discussion was unanticipated; they clearly stated that "Due to non-serious attitude of students towards education, we don’t encourage students to positively contribute to class by class discussion. The scenario in the madrasah was completely different from other two school systems in a manner that they use the method of dictation and memorizing, however, there were some subjects taught in madrasah were including some level of class discussion. The graphs are clearly showing the trend of class discussion in these schools. Although there is much variation in time spent on class discussion, in the aggregate, private school students present their schools with greater participation than their counterparts. The background of the students enrolled in private school should also be taken into account for better comparison, it is not that the teachers of public schools are not willing for class discussion but the lack of confidence in public school students leads them to unhealthy class discussion. In public school, the students come from more diverse racial/ethnic and linguistic
backgrounds; therefore, the students don’t contribute in class due to hesitation. The public school teachers are more likely than private school teachers to perceive their students and their families as having problems that can interfere with learning. Overall, teachers in public schools are more likely than their private school counterparts to have certain attributes that are thought to contribute to effective teaching.

In the aggregate, private schools seem to offer a greater sense of community, greater teacher autonomy in the classroom and more local influence over curriculum and important school policies. In addition, on average private schools have a climate that would appear to be more conducive to learning, including greater safety and fewer problems caused by students having poor attitudes toward learning or negative interactions.

5.2. Class Room Organization
The organization and management of learning space inside the classroom is an aspect of teaching methodology which is highly neglected in our society. The organization of learning space covers desk/seating arrangement, class room environment, lighting, infrastructure, soft
boards and design of class room. Not only can a well-designed class room environment attract the child and engage him/her, it can also assist teaching and class room work. For example, seating children in groups can foster cooperation during learning and group assignments, which can help children’s to learn that how to integrate well inside a group or team. The private school class rooms were designed in more learning-friendly manner. We observed lot 0f soft-boards displaying students work were pictures of various events held at school and celebrating student achievements. The class rooms were colorful and attractive by comparison. The entire school walls were decorated by famous personalities for learning and maxims. As we entered a government schools class room, we were struck by how pale, simplistic and dull the ambience of the class was. There were no soft boards and no sign of student’s work being displayed. The class room furniture was unmaintained and ordinary. The seating arrangement of students was done in simple rows and columns. The class observation in Madrasahs, private schools and government schools in terms of organization was different.

5.3. Sex Segregation in Schools

If there is one kind of oppression against a demographic group which outlets all other known injustices, it is arguably the marginalization of women by the patriarchal system of society. This oppression continues to compromise women around the world. Many manifestations of this ruthless patriarchy exist in Pakistan such as honor killing against women, refusal of equal educational access for women. Sex segregation in schools is also a counter-productive phenomenon which was observed in this study. From a comparative stand point, we observed extremely higher sex segregation in madrasahs and government schools than we did in private schools, even though it did exist there as well. The middle schools of the government sector are sex-segregated as there are separate schools for boys and girls. Not only the students, but the teachers in these schools are also segregated by sex. Most teachers at a boy’s government middle school are male, whereas most teachers at a girl’s government middle school are female.

5.4. Conclusion and Recommendations

Pakistan is a society which is plagued by innumerable social evils such as political instability, Economic stagnation and social disruption. In this context bringing people together and avoiding the emergence of conflict is of even higher value. They are investing in a generation of people who face radically different educational opportunities, which exacerbates social and economic inequality. This is because the students of elitist private schools receive the kind of skills and knowledge which makes them employable and desirable in the market place for
labor, both domestically and internationally. The public school students face pitiful job opportunities in comparison to private school students on the whole. Similarly, most madrasah students desire to become “Mufti’s” or “Aalims” as students and teachers told us in the madrasah which means such students are making no considerable contribution to the economy or society. Therefore, through the variations in teaching methodology, school infrastructure and environment, prevalent ideologies in each school to mention a few, schooling systems reinforce social and economic inequality in the country. Academic activities in madrassas tend to revolve round the teacher-centered lecture method instead of more interactive learning methods (Jinnah institute). The government schools face predominantly administrative problems and are thus much more malleable in nature. The main obstacle in this sector is the lack of prioritization of the issue of education which is a symptom of vision-less leadership and weak democracy. Much more budget allocation is required in education to uplift the infrastructure of government schools and to provide quality teacher training programs. Most private schools need to improve upon their career counseling services as students in Pakistan are often misled or forced by parents or peers to select future options which are incompatible with their aptitudes or interests.

References

© 2019 by the authors. TWASP, NY, USA. Author/authors are fully responsible for the text, figure, data in above pages. This article is an open access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution (CC BY) license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/)